

THE CLINICAL DIAGNOSIS OF PERSONALITY DISORDERS, GENDER AND SOCIAL CLASS DIFFERENCES

Arsen Kllogjri
ALBANIA

ABSTRACT

A lot of studies support the existence of gender and social class influence in the diagnosis of personality disorders and hospitalization of individuals who suffer from these disorders. The aim of this study is to determine whether mental health professionals are influenced by the individual characteristics of the patient in how diagnose mental disorders. The sample of this study consists in total of 132 students and mental health professionals. Sample case studies are presented which have been changed gender and social class and were asked to diagnose and determine whether the case should be hospitalized. The results show that no changes influenced by gender in the diagnosis. The test for the importance of the relationship between casual sex hospitalization and show the value of Chi Square test was 0.004, less than $p = 0.005$, ie, determining the gender affects hospitalization. Values of Chi-Square test were not statistically significant relationship between diagnosis and social class. The results show a statistically significant relationship between hospitalization and social class, Chi-Square values are 0.002, less than $p = 0.005$, there are differences in hospitalization case influenced by social class. Recommended further studies should be conducted to explore the impact of gender and social class of patient in diagnosing personality disorders and hospitalization.

Keywords: Gender bias, social class, diagnostics, hospitalization.

The purpose of this study is:

1. To determine whether mental health professionals are influenced by gender and social class of patients in diagnosing personality disorders.
2. To determine whether mental health professionals are influenced by gender and social class of patient hospitalization personality disorders.

This study has three main questions:

- How will influence clinical judgment of mental health professionals based on the individual's gender and personality disorders?
- How will influence clinical judgment of mental health professionals on the basis of social class of individual personality disorders?
- How will influence clinical judgment of mental health professionals in connection with the hospitalization of individuals with personality disorders?

THE THEORETICAL BASIS

The possible existence of impartiality are maintained in the diagnosis of mental disorders is not a new concept. Numerous studies were conducted that support the presence of the diagnosis and impartiality are various factors that affect this phenomenon. So many scholars have argued that Bias in establishing the diagnosis are rooted in Bias now existing in our society. While other researchers are entirely confident that lies along the bias specifically

diagnostic system used (ex, in: Diagnostic Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM). And another group of researchers insist and believe that these are determined by clinicians bias who decide the diagnosis. There is a particular theoretical basis assumes that the influence of the male or female gender and social class in the diagnosis of personality disorders.

However there are several main studies that serve as a support to study the issue in psychology, these studies were carried out:

- Warner (1978)
- Ford and Widiger (1989)
- (Garb, 1997)
- "Midtown Manhattan Study" (Srole et al 1961)
- Hollingshead and Redlich (1958)

The hypotheses

- Hypothesis 1: The mental health professionals are influenced by gender and social class of individuals with psychological concerns in diagnosing personality disorders.
- Hypothesis 2: The mental health professionals are influenced by gender and social class of individuals with psychological concerns for hospitalization of individuals suffering from personality disorders.

METHODOLOGY

The sample of the study will consist of: psychology students (bachelor and master), psychologists, professionals, students of psychiatry, psychiatric professionals. The sample will be approximately 130 mental health professionals. The sample will be for diagnostic assessment with a case study of personality disorders. This event will be created with the mixing of symptoms of antisocial personality disorder and personality disorder Histrionic. Gender and social class of the patient in the case study will be manipulated, so that in total there will be 4 cases with symptoms of mixed gender and social class to manipulate. It will be measured if it will change the way cases are diagnosed depending on social class and sex. All the data collected will be analyzed through the statistical program SPSS.

The sample

- Bachelor psychology students (26)
- Students master psychology since I (25)
- Students year psychology master II (16)
- Students of psychiatry (36)
- Professional Psychologists (18)
- Psychiatrist professionals (11)

Instrument

- Case with symptoms CPA and CPH
- Two cases received in the book of Theodore Millon, Personality Disorders in Modern Life, Second Edition, 2004 (electronic version).
- Translation of cases, integration into a single case.
- adapted to the cultural context Albanian

With the change of gender and social class were formed 4 - final combinations:

- Case 1 (female - poor)
- Case 2 (male - poor)
- Case 3 (female - rich)
- Case 4 (male - rich).

Limitations of the study

- Results are compared not with other studies
- Review of the instrument
- Number of Sample
- Sample selection
- Results do not generalize

The importance of this study will stay in exploring the possibility that mental health professionals are influenced by individual characteristics (gender and social class of patients) in how diagnose mental disorders and weigh patient hospitalization.

CONCLUSIONS

- Women diagnosed with more personality disorder Histrionic, while men with Antisocial Personality Disorder
- Social class does not affect the diagnosis of personality disorders
- Women are more often referred for hospitalization
- Individuals poor class more often referred for hospitalization
- There are no differences between psychologists and psychiatrists in the diagnosis
- Psychiatrists are more susceptible to the occasional hospitalization

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Replication study with larger sample
- Exploring the factors affecting hospitalization
- Review of the wrong reasons diagnosis
- Improving the diagnosis
- Take into account the results of the study

REFERENCES

- American Psychiatric Association (2000). *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders. Fourth Edition*. Washington, DC: British Library.
- Anderson, K. G., Sankis, L. M., & Widiger, T. A. (2001). Pathology versus statistical infrequency: Potential sources of gender bias in personality disorder criteria. *The Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 189, 661-668.
- Becker, D. & Lamb, S. (1994). Sex bias in the diagnosis of borderline personality disorder and posttraumatic stress disorder. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 25, 55-61.
- Blashfield, R. K., Sprock, J., Pinkston, K., & Hodgin, J (1985). Exemplar prototypes of personality disorder diagnoses. *Comprehensive Psychiatry*, 26, 11- 21.
- Broverman, I. K., Broverman, D. M., Clarkson, F. E., Rosenkrantz, P. S., & Vogel, S. R. (1970) Sex-role stereotypes and clinical judgments of mental health. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 34, 1-7.
- Caplan, P. J. (1992). Gender issues in the diagnosis of mental disorder. *Women and Therapy*, 12, 71-82.

- Davidson, C. V., & Abramowitz, S. I., (1980). Sex bias in clinical judgment: Later empirical returns. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 4, 377-395. DOI: 10.1037/0022-006x.73.6.1146
- Ford, R. M., & Widiger, A. Th., (1989). Sex Bias in the Diagnosis of Histrionic and Antisocial Personality Disorders. *Journal of Consuhimand Clinical Ryehabay*. Vd. 57, No. 2, 301-305.
- Garb, N. H. (1997). Race bias, Social Class bias and gender bias in clinical judgment. *Clinical Psychology: Science and Practice*. Vol. 4, No. 2, 99-120.
- Greve, J. (2012). *An empirical investigation of all Danish men born in 1981. Study Paper No. 45*. Publikuar nga: University Press of Southern Denmark 2012 ISBN: 9788790199777
- Helzer, E. J., & Hudziak, J. J.(2002). Defining Psychopathology in the 21 st Century. *American Psychopathological Association Washington, DC*.
- Hopwood, J. C., Thomas, M. K., Markon, E. K., Wright, C. G. A., & Krueger, F., Robert (2012). *DSM-5 Personality Traits and DSM-IV Personality Disorders*. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*. DOI: 10.1037/a0026656
- Kass, F., Spitzer, R., & Williams, J. (1983). An empirical study of the issue of sex bias in the diagnostic criteria of DSM-111 Axis II personality disorders. *American Psychologist*, 38,799-801.
- Kring, M. A., Johnson, L. S., Davison, G., & Neale, J (2012). *Abnormal Psychology. Twelfth Edition*. John Wilely & Sons, Inc.
- Lewis, R., Lmadan, M. R., Wald, & Curtis, M. (2006). Gender Bias in the Diagnosis of a Geriatric Standardized a Patient: A Potential Confounding Variable. *Academic Psychiatry*, 30:5. E marrë nga: <http://ap.psychiatryonline.org>
- Lootens, C (2005). *Gender and ethnic biases in personality disorder diagnostic criteria. Eastern Illinois University*. E marrë nga: <http://thekeep.eiu.edu/theses/1057>
- McKibben, J. A. (2003). Sex and cult affiliation biases ine the Diagnosis os Dependnt and Narcisstistic Personality Disorders: An Empirical investigation. *College of Arts and Sciences of Ohio University*.
- Millon, T., Grossman, S., Millon, C., Meagher, S., & Ramnath, R. (2004). *Personality Disorders in Modern Life. Seconde Edition*. John Wilely & Sons, Inc.
- Pickard, H., Hoermann, S., Zupanick, E. C., & Dombeck. (2011). *What Is Personality Disorder?* The Johns Hopkins University Press
- Serrita, J. J., Oltmanns, Th., South, S.C & Turkheimer, E. (2007). Gender Bias in Diagnostic Criteria for Personality Disorders: An Item Response Theory Analysis. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, Vol. 116, No. 1, 166–175.
- Skodol, E. A., & Bender, S. D., (2003). Why are women diagnosed Borderline more than men? *PBychiatric Quarterly*, Vol. 74, No. 4.
- Skodol, E. A., Clark, A. l., Bender, S. D., Krueger, F. Robert., Morey, C., Leslie., Verheul, R., Alarcon, D. R., Bell, C. C., Siever, J. Larry., & Oldham, M. J., (2011). Proposed Changes in Personality and Personality Disorder Assessment and Diagnosis for DSM-5 Part I: Description and Rationale. *Personality Disorders: Theory, Research, and Treatment, American Psychiatric Association*, Vol. 2, No. 1, 4–22. DOI: 10.1037/a00218
- Smith, E. C., (2011). Gender-biased Diagnosing, the Consequences of Psychosomatic Misdiagnosis and Doing Credibility. *Sociology Student Scholarship*. E marrë nga: http://scholar.oxy.edu/sociology_student/5
- Suli, A., Çomo, A., & Alikaj, V. (2004). *Psikologjia Mjekësore*. Tiranë: Geer
- Wadsworth, E. mM., & Achenbach, M. T. (2005). Explaining the links between Low Socioeconomic Status and Psychopathology: Testing two mechanisms of social

causation Hypothesis. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, Vol. 73, No.6, 1146-1153.

Widiger, T., & Frances, A. (1985). Axis II personality disorders: Diagnostic and treatment issues. *Hospital and Community Psychiatry*, 36, 619-627.